

Duration of the provision of services from outside India is not relevant for the purposes of service permanent establishment

Executive summary

- The Delhi bench of the Tribunal in Clifford Chance¹ held that for the purposes of service permanent establishment (service PE) in India, the actual performance of services in India is essential. Accordingly, only the duration of the employees physically present in India for furnishing the services is to be taken into account for the purposes of the duration threshold under the service PE clause of the treaty. The Tribunal rejected the tax officer's position that the duration of the provision of services from outside India is also to be included.
- The Tribunal also held that the taxpayer's presence in India should not include the days during which the employees did not render any services to the clients such as the employees' vacation days and days on which they performed non-revenue generating business development activities.
- Further, the taxpayer's presence should be computed on the basis of solar days (and not man days) i.e., common days (i.e., days on which more than one employee was present in India) should be counted as one day.

Facts of the case

- The taxpayer, a resident of Singapore, provided legal advisory services to its clients in India.
- A part of the services were rendered remotely from outside India, and some services were rendered by its employees physically present in India.

- The tax officer held that the taxpayer had permanent establishment (PE) in India in accordance with the service PE clause of the India-Singapore treaty (the treaty) as the taxpayer provided the services for more than 90 days during the relevant tax years.
- The service PE clause of the treaty provides that a non-resident shall be deemed to have a PE in India if it furnishes services within India through employees or other personnel if the activities of that nature continue within India for a period or periods aggregating more than 90 days.
- The tax officer was of the view that for the purposes of the service PE clause, the aggregate duration of provision of services by the nonresident within as well as outside India is relevant. There is no mandate in the treaty that the employees providing services within India must be stationed in India. The duration of the services provided from outside India is also to be considered for the purposes of the service PE in India.
- The taxpayer argued that it is the performance of services in India which is relevant for the purposes of the service PE clause. During the relevant tax year, the aggregate stay of its employees in India for furnishing of services was 44 days² which is less than the 90-days threshold provided under the treaty.

¹ Clifford Chance PTE Ltd. v. ACIT (ITA Nos. 2681 & 3377/Del/2023) (Del) - Source: Taxsutra

² It was substantiated based on the time sheet of the employees, the HR system of the taxpayer and the employees' declaration.

Tribunal's decision

- The Delhi bench of the Tribunal held that for the purposes of the service PE clause, the actual performance of services in India is essential and accordingly, only the duration of the employees physically present in India for furnishing the services are to be taken into account.
- Accordingly, the taxpayer does not have a service PE in India as the presence of its employees in India is less than the 90-days threshold.
- The Tribunal also accepted the positions taken by the taxpayer for calculating its presence in India for the purposes of service PE:
 - The taxpayer's presence in India should not include the days during which the employees (though physically present in India) did not render any services to the taxpayer's clients. These include the employees' vacation period and days on which they performed non-revenue generating business development activities (such as identification of customers, technical presentation/providing information to prospective customers, developing market opportunities, providing quotations to the customers).
 - The presence in India should be based on solar days (and not man days). Accordingly, the common days (i.e., days on which more than one employee was present in India) should be counted as one day.
- The Tribunal distinguished the decision in ABB FZ³ based on the facts of the case.
- The Tribunal also rejected the tax officer's reliance on the OECD interim report 2018⁴ on the ground that there is no provision in the treaty regarding the virtual service PE. The report itself mentions that in the absence of any amendments to the treaty provisions, the measures relating to the virtual PE can be challenged by the taxpayers before the courts.

Our comments

The Tribunal has reiterated an important principle that for constituting a service PE in India, only the duration of the employees physically present in India for furnishing the services are to be taken into account. The Tribunal rejected the concept of virtual service PE in the absence of any specific provision in the treaty.



ABB FZ-LLC v. DCIT [2017] 83 taxmann.com 86 (Beng)
OECD Interim Report 2018 under the OECD/G20 BEPS Project Titled "Tax challenges arising from Digitalisation"

KPMG in India addresses:

Ahmedahad

Commerce House V, 9th Floor, 902, Near Vodafone House, Corporate Road, Prahlad Nagar, Ahmedabad - 380 051. Tel: +91 79 4040 2200

Bengaluru

Embassy Golf Links Business Park, Pebble Beach, 'B' Block, 1st & 2nd Floor. Off Intermediate Ring Road, Bengaluru - 560071 Tel: +91 80 6833 5000

Chandigarh

SCO 22-23 (1st Floor), Sector 8C, Madhya Marg, Chandigarh - 160 009. Tel: +91 172 664 4000

Chennai

KRM Towers, Ground Floor, 1, 2 & 3 Floor, Harrington Road, Chetpet, Chennai - 600 031. Tel: +91 44 3914 5000

Gurugram

Building No.10, 8th Floor, DLF Cyber City, Phase II, Gurugram, Haryana - 122 002. Tel: +91 124 307 4000

Hvderabad

Salarpuria Knowledge City, 6th Floor, Unit 3, Phase III, Sy No. 83/1, Plot No 2, Serilingampally Ranga Reddy District, Hyderabad - 500 081. Tel: +91 40 6111 6000

Jaipur

Regus Radiant Centre Pvt Ltd., Level 6, Jaipur Centre Mall, B2 By pass Tonk Road, Jaipur - 302 018. Tel: +91 141 - 7103224

Syama Business Centre, 3rd Floor, NH By Pass Road, Vytilla, Kochi – 682 019. Tel: +91 484 302 5600

Kolkata

Unit No. 604. 6th Floor, Tower - 1, Godrej Waterside, Sector - V. Salt Lake. Kolkata – 700 091. Tel: +91 33 4403 4000

Mumbai

2nd Floor, Block T2 (B Wing), Lodha Excellus, Apollo Mills Compound, N M Joshi Marg, Mahalaxmi, Mumbai- 400011 Tel: +91 22 3989 6000

Noida

Unit No. 501, 5th Floor, Advant Navis Business Park, Tower-A. Plot# 7. Sector 142. Expressway Noida, Gautam Budh Nagar, Noida - 201 305. Tel: +91 0120 386 8000

9th floor, Business Plaza, Westin Hotel Campus, 36/3-B, Koregaon Park Annex. Mundhwa Road, Ghorpadi, Pune - 411 001 Tel: +91 20 6747 7000

Vadodara

Ocean Building, 303, 3rd Floor, Beside Center Square Mall, Opp. Vadodara Central Mall, Dr. Vikram Sarabhai Marg, Vadodara - 390 023. Tel: +91 265 619 4200

Vijayawada

Door No. 54-15-18E. Gurunanak Nagar Road, NH 5, Opp. Executive Club, Vijayawada, Krishna District, Andhra Pradesh - 520 008. Tel: +91 0866 669 1000

kpmg.com/in

Follow us on:

kpmg.com/in/socialmedia











The information contained herein is of a general nature and is not intended to address the circumstances of any particular individual or entity. Although we endeavour to provide accurate and timely information, there can be no guarantee that such information is accurate as of the date it is received or that it will continue to be accurate in the future. No one should act on such information without appropriate professional advice after a thorough examination of the particular situation.

KPMG Assurance and Consulting Services LLP, Lodha Excelus, Apollo Mills Compound, NM Joshi Marg, Mahalaxmi, Mumbai - 400 011 Phone: +91 22 3989 6000, Fax: +91 22 3983 6000

© 2024 KPMG Assurance and Consulting Services LLP, an Indian Limited Liability Partnership and a member firm of the KPMG global organization of independent member firms affiliated with KPMG International Limited, a private English company limited by guarantee. All rights reserved.

The KPMG name and logo are trademarks used under license by the independent member firms of the KPMG global organization.

This document is meant for e-communication only.